



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee Meeting #9

Thursday, August 15, 2019
CSC Meeting 6:00 p.m. – 8:30 p.m.
San Bernardino Valley College
701 S. Mt. Vernon Ave., San Bernardino, CA 92410

Time	Item	Presenter	Why is this important?
5:30 pm	• Doors Open		
6:00 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcoming Remarks • Announcements • Community Testimonials • Meeting #8 Recap & Current Progress: What we've done so far – 15 min	Angelica Balderas (Co-host)	To understand where we are in developing the community plans
6:15 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation on Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy & Action (ChICCCCAA): #MotherEarthRising – 10 min Committee Discussion – 10 min	Jason Martinez (ChICCCCAA Representative)	To understand current efforts in the community by CSC members to address air quality concerns
6:35 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governing Board Process Overview and Stationary Source Committee Meeting Recap – 15 min Committee Discussion – 10 min	Diana Thai (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)	To provide information on the Governing Board process and provide a recap of the Stationary Source Committee Meeting
7:00 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) and Emissions Reduction Targets* – 15 min Committee Discussion – 35 min	Diana Thai (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)	To provide an update on revisions of the Draft CERP based on comments received To provide information on the emissions reduction targets
7:50 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community Air Monitoring Highlights* – 10 min Committee Discussion – 15 min	Payam Pakbin (Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)	To provide an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed in the community
8:15 pm	Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders – 5 min	Angelica Balderas (Co-host)	
8:20 pm	Public Comment – 10 min	Members of the Public	
8:30 pm	Adjourn		

* Staff is also available for questions after the meeting.



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee Meeting #9

Thursday, August 15, 2019
CSC Meeting 6:00 p.m. – 8:30 p.m.
San Bernardino Valley College
701 S. Mt. Vernon Ave., San Bernardino, CA 92410

Affiliation	Representative (Primary ¹ ; Alternate ²)	Participant in the Committee Meeting Discussion
Category: Community Organization		
Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy and Action	Jason Martinez ¹ ; Paula Alvarez Venegas ²	Jason Martinez
Muscoy Action Committee	Jane Hunt-Ruble	Jane Hunt-Ruble
Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCA EJ)	Ericka Flores ¹ ; Andrea Vidaurre ²	
Sierra Club, My Generation	Angelica Balderas	
Safe Routes to School	Demi Espinoza	
CLCV ED Fund	Matt Abularach-Macias	Matt Abularach-Macias
Category: Active residents (not representing a Community Organization or a Business)		
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Valerie Dobesh	Valerie Dobesh
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Mathew Taylor	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Ruben Garza	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Maria G. Corona	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Graciela Regalado	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Olga Medina	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Lorena Rodarte	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	James Albert	James Albert
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Ada Trujillo	Ada Trujillo
Active Resident – Muscoy	Miguel A. Rivera	
Active Resident – Muscoy	Christopher Alonso	Christopher Alonso
Active Resident – San Bernardino	Cesar Magana	Cesar Magana
Category: Agency, School, University, Hospital		
San Bernardino County Land Use Planning Manager	Karen Watkins ¹ ; Suzanne Peterson ²	Suzanne Peterson
San Bernardino County Department of Public Health	Bernadette Beltran ¹ ; Corwin Porter ²	Bernadette Beltran
California State University, San Bernardino (CSUSB)	Andreas Beyersdorf ¹ ; Rudy Morales Gamez ²	Andreas Beyersdorf
City of San Bernardino	Chantal Power ¹ ; Elizabeth Mora-Rodriguez ²	Chantal Power
Omnitrans	Anna Jaiswal ¹ ; Jeremiah Bryant ²	Anna Jaiswal
Loma Linda University School of Public Health	Dr. Rhonda Spencer-Hwang ¹ ; Dr. Ryan Sinclair ²	Ryan Sinclair
San Bernardino County Transit Authority	Otis Greer ¹ ; Nicole Soto ²	
San Bernardino Valley College	Mary Valdemar	
Category: Elected Officials		
Assembly member Eloise Reyes Office	Maha Rizvi	
Supervisor Josie Gonzales	Erika Willhite ¹ , Lisha B. Smith ²	

Category: Business Representative, Business Organization or Labor Organization		
Railroads – BNSF	LaDonna DiCamillo ¹ , Marisa Blackshire ²	
Warehouse/Logistics - Pacific Mountain Logistics - San Bernardino	B.J. Patterson	
Utility - Southern California Edison	Christopher Abel ¹ ; Tammy Yamasaki ²	Christopher Abel
Wyatt's Paint & Body, Inc.	Kris Wyatt ¹ ; Randy Wyatt ²	
Tacos Don Ramon	Angel Rodriguez	

Meeting Summary: During CSC Meeting #9, several CSC members presented on their efforts to address air quality concerns. Diana Thai (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) provided an update on the revisions being made to the Draft CERP document based on committee feedback and comments received. She also gave an overview of the Governing Board process and Stationary Source Committee Meeting. Payam Pakbin (Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) provided an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed in the community.

- **Welcoming Remarks, Community Testimonials, and Meeting #8 Recap & Current Progress:**
What We've Done So Far –Angelica Balderas (Co-host)
 - Angelica Balderas (co-host) introduced herself and reviewed housekeeping duties and emergency procedures. She made a few announcements and welcomed Mario Vasquez to make a community testimonial.
 - Mario Vasquez shared that community members in San Bernardino have organized around the proposed expansion of operations at the San Bernardino airport. He said a coalition of community organizations around the Inland Empire have come together with residents to implement a community benefits agreement. They are seeking good jobs and clean air. Mario said he is spreading the word about the San Bernardino airport and would like public comments and input. Mario also wants everyone to see that this project helps to address the needs of the community.
 - Professor Jonathan London (UC Davis) announced that he is working with CARB as an independent evaluator of the AB 617 process. He is documenting and evaluating what is working well and what is not. He shared that a survey was provided for everyone to fill out and he is conducting interviews.
 - Angelica Balderas introduced Daniel Wong to provide an update on the community tour. He said there is a tentative date for the end of September and will be speaking to those who have signed up to guide the tour.
 - Angelica Balderas gave an overview of the meeting objectives. She mentioned that both Abram Gastelum and Ericka Flores will step down from the CSC and they will be replaced for future meetings. She went over the progress of the CERP efforts in the San Bernardino, Muscoy community. She announced that the CSC presenter, Jason Martinez (ChICCAA), will be postponing his presentation until the next CSC meeting. She introduced Diana Thai.

- **Stationary Source Committee Meeting Recap and Governing Board Process Overview – Diana Thai (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)**

- Diana Thai went over the Governing Board process. She shared that the public can participate in the Governing Board meeting that will be held on September 6th and address the Board to provide their comments.
 - Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) asked about the public comment process. She asked that the CSC formally recommend to the Board that the comment period stay at three minutes, regardless of the number of comments from participants.
 - Wayne Nastri (Executive Officer, South Coast AQMD) said that we welcome the recommendation, ultimately the Governing Board has discretion on this matter.
- Diana Thai went over key items from the Stationary Source Committee Meeting that was held on July 26th. She said they discussed the CERP for Year 1 communities and recommendations for Year 2 communities. Some of key issues were discussed, which including requests for an analysis of emission sources, quantifiable emission reduction targets, and to address health metrics. She mentioned that the actions in the CERP provide long term benefits for public health, which may not be quantifiable in a health study.
- Q and A on Stationary Source Committee Meeting
 - James Albert (Active Resident, San Bernardino) wanted an update on the Indirect Source Rule process.
 - Diana Thai said they can provide an update of the Indirect Source Rule working group that occurred and the South Coast AQMD website is consistently updating everyone on the meeting dates.
 - Mary Valdemar said she is happy to see that the Breathmobile is included as an action. She asked if preschools and charter schools have also been included.
 - Diana responded that they have been included.
- **Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan and Emissions Reduction Targets** - Diana Thai (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)
 - Diana Thai said that the Final Draft CERP will be released August 30th. She said comments received by August 6th or from the last CSC Meeting #8, will be considered for the Final Draft Final CERP. She talked about how the actions in the CERP will reduce emissions and emission reduction targets. She said where they can quantify reductions, they included this in the CERP. She said the estimated NOx reductions will be 40 to 50 tons per year and 0.5 to 0.6 ton per year for particulate matter (PM). She talked about the rule development process and emphasized that it is open to the public and rule concepts are discussed. She explained examples of achieving emission reductions through different strategies such as monitoring, enforcement, and/or collaboration. She said that additional metrics will be included in the CERP.
 - Matt Abularach-Macias (CLCV ED Fund) asked if there is a way the District can enforce rules that make it more obvious for people to determine which trucks are allowed to idle.

- Diana Thai responded that CARB addresses rules on mobile sources such as trucks.
 - CARB staff added that stickers are already on vehicles to indicate which are clean-idle trucks, and a possible solution would be to increase the size of the stickers.
- Matt Abularach-Macias asked if metrics will be included in the CERP.
 - Diana Thai said the metrics will be included and are community- specific.
- Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) said today was the last day for the County response to comments for a Draft EIR for the county's General Plan. She questioned why trucks are allowed in unincorporated areas and why the County was not addressing this.
- Matt Abularach-Macias asked what the percentage of emissions reductions (in tons per year) would equate to the overall source emissions data.
 - Jo Kay Ghosh said that these emission reductions are what AB 617 will achieve in addition to reductions achieved elsewhere (the Air Quality Management Plan). She said there are significant reductions and other work being done in other programs to reduce NOx emissions, which are not included in the CERP emission reduction targets.
- A member of the public asked if the metric is from outreach and incentive efforts or overall. He wanted to know what the reduction was last year. He wanted to know if there would have been a reduction in a typical year without additional funds. He also asked if there is a timeline for fugitive emission reductions.
 - Diana Thai responded that the reductions specified in the CERP are from incentives.
 - Naveen Berry said throughout the region they looked at applications throughout the three AB 617 communities and looked at what additional funding is available. He said the incentive funds will result in further reductions.
 - Diana Thai said depending on what is found through monitoring, different strategies would be used to reduce the source of fugitive emissions.
- Andreas Beyersdorf (California State University, San Bernardino) told Matt that 50 tons would be about a 5 percent reduction per year. He asked if there has been any thought on reductions for 1,3-butadiene emissions.
 - Diana Thai said that the emission sources prioritized included primarily diesel PM; thus, 1,3-butadiene was not specified; however, South Coast AQMD minimizes emissions where possible (e.g. through toxics programs).
- A member of the public asked if we can enforce precautions towards companies who have trucks or polluting vehicles.
 - Diana Thai said that we can only enforce rules and regulations on the equipment and not the driver. She added that South Coast AQMD has a rule for companies with a certain number of employees are required to comply with rideshare requirements.

- **Community Air Monitoring Highlights**-Payam Pakbin (Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)
 - Payam Pakbin shared updates on the air monitoring activities in the San Bernardino, Muscoy community. He talked about fixed monitoring and said it serves as the baseline to provide information about general air quality concerns. He said data can be accessed through the Data Display Tool. He discussed mobile platform measurements and explained that these measurements will continue in this community. He shared preliminary results from mobile measurements at and near the Omnitrans bus yard. He noted that this area has been a major concern from the CSC due to proximity to Alessandro Elementary School. He showed measured methane (a good tracer for natural gas) concentration around the Omnitrans bus yard and explained that through mobile monitoring, they can identify emissions hotspots and potential locations for subsequent mobile and/or fixed monitoring. He also discussed monitoring around cement handling facilities with a focus on fugitive dust and potential hexavalent chromium in this area. He shared some of the measurements and results of the monitoring that showed hexavalent chromium levels near these facilities were in the typical ambient levels.
 - Q and A:
 - Jane Hunt-Ruble wanted to verify one of the plant locations on the map of the cement monitoring facilities.
 - Payam Pakbin offered to look into it further. He said the one on the map is owned by Vulcan.
 - Mary Valdemar suggested maps that can be seen by those that have vision impairment. She suggested multicolor maps and different shading. She said that is easier and more accessible for people with disabilities.
 - Payam responded that this was a good suggestion but he wants to ensure that a different interpretation would not occur since multicolor scheme could be confused with Air Quality Index colors.
 - Dr. Ryan Sinclair asked if there can be an annual mean of wind roses.
 - Payam said yes.
- **Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders** - Angelica Balderas (Co-host)
 - Angelica Balderas went over the next steps and important reminders.
 - CSC Meeting #10 will be held on September 19th (6:00 p.m.-8:30 p.m.) at San Bernardino Valley College.
 - Next Topics for CSC Meeting #10:
 - Governing Board meeting recap
 - Final CERP
 - CARB board consideration process
 - Community Air Monitoring Highlights
 - Future Steps and Reminders:
 - The Final Draft CERP will be presented to the Governing Board September 6th, 2019 at 9:00 am at South Coast AQMD.

- Indirect Source Rule (ISR) working group meeting will be Friday August 23, 2019 at 10:00 am at South Coast AQMD

Public Comment:

- Chris Chavez said he submitted comments regarding the CERPs. He said any new emission reductions from the rule making process should be presented to the steering committee. He said South Coast AQMD needs to enforce stronger rules and higher fees as part of the AB 617 strategy. He also said there is a need for an Indirect Source Rule to reduce emissions. He encouraged South Coast AQMD to be involved in the airport project and increase the amount of responsibilities to polluters.
- Matt Abularach said the concerns resonate from what Chris Chavez said. He asked if CSC Meeting #10 meeting is the final meeting. He said there should be a meeting to discuss progress.
 - Diana Thai said there is one more CSC meeting for this year, but there will also be quarterly update meetings during the CERP implementation.
- Mary Valdemar said there needs to be an in-depth conversation about the airport issue and how it intercepts with what is going on.
 - A member of public said they have gathered to organize in the community, going to each door to notify the community of what is going on with the airport. They are waiting to provide written comments to fill out their forms and provide them to her so that would count as a community member to address their concerns. She shared the website which is <https://sbairportcommunities.org/>
- A member of the public said there has been a lot of destruction of parks and she is worried that the building of roads are going to take away their trees.
 - Diana Thai said they have an action in the CERP to identify funding or programs to increase green space in this community and this information will be shared if funding or programs are available.
 - Jo Kay said the priority in the CERP is to reduce emissions from sources.
- Chantal Power (City of San Bernardino) asked if technology is available for reducing particle emissions.
 - Diana Thai said there are control devices available that address certain pollutants.
- A member of the public asked why schools are removing trees.
- Chantal Power said we have to talk to the school district.
- Jane Hunt-Ruble said she heard at the last meeting that citizens were unaware of an EIR (Environmental Impact Report) of a project at the airport.
 - A member of the public from the airport said they provided a minimum report at the last meeting. They are requesting an EIR and a community benefits agreement (CBA).
- Jason Martinez asked if the airport is in the community boundary. He also wanted to know if there is enforcement for not complying with rules. He said something can be done outside of this space regarding trees and green space.
 - Diana Thai responded that the airport is not in the community boundary; however, the sources of concern, e.g. trucks coming from the airport will be addressed

through the actions in the CERP. She said people are responsible for following the rules, and if not, enforcement authorities can.

- Mary Valdemar said she appreciates what is being done at the airport and in this AB 617 process. She wants this process to be duplicated outside of the agencies here.
- A member of the public said the City Council and elected officials need to be held accountable. She wants to encourage people to be involved with the city.
- A member of the public said green spaces are being taken over by warehouses. She said we are neglecting the issue of warehouse jobs.
 - Diana Thai said the CERP includes an action to work with the City to discuss and enhance land use policies.
- Jane Hunt-Ruble said she is worried about the neighborhood being taken over by warehouses.
- A member of the public from the airport stated some of the names of those in charge of the City of San Bernardino and said that these people have the authority to do what they want with the airport.