



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach

Community Workshop and Community Steering Committee Meeting #8

Thursday, July 11, 2019

Workshop 5:30 – 6:00 p.m. CSC Meeting 6:00 – 8:30 p.m.

Wilmington Senior Center

1371 Eubank Avenue

Wilmington, CA 90744

Time	Item	Presenter	Why is this important?
5:45 pm	Doors open		
6:00 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Welcoming Remarks CSC Business: Charter, Roster & Meeting Format Meeting #7 Recap & Current Progress: What we've done so far – 15 min 	Facilitator Committee Members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incentives Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Air Monitoring Plans (CAMP) To understand where we are in the developing plans
6:05 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> California Air Resources Board (CARB) Enforcement Actions – 15 min Committee Discussion – 25 min 	CARB Staff South Coast AQMD Staff; CARB Staff; Committee Members	To understand enforcement actions that will be taken by CARB to address the air quality concerns in this community
6:45 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Marathon Petroleum Company – 5 min Q & A on this agenda item – 10 min 	Susan Stark <i>(Regulatory Affairs Manager, Marathon Petroleum Company)</i> Committee Members	To understand current efforts in the community by CSC members to address air quality concerns
7:00 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Update - Comments Received* – 10 min Committee Discussion – 40 min 	Jo Kay Ghosh <i>(Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)</i> Committee Members	To provide an update on revisions of the Discussion Draft CERP based on committee feedback and comments received
7:50 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community Air Monitoring Update* – 10 min Q & A on this agenda item – 15 min 	Payam Pakbin <i>(Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)</i> Committee Members	To provide an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed as described in the CAMP
8:15 pm	Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders – 5 min	Facilitator; Committee Members	
8:20 pm	Public Comment – 10 min	Members of the Public	
8:30 pm	Adjourn		

* Staff is also available for questions after the meeting.



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach
Community Workshop and Community Steering Committee Meeting #8

Thursday, July 11, 2019 — 6:00 p.m. – 8:30 p.m.
Wilmington Senior Center
1371 Eubank Ave, Wilmington, CA 90744

Affiliation	Representative (Primary ¹ , Secondary ²)	Participant in the Committee Meeting Discussion
Category: Community Organization		
Century Villages at Cabrillo	Jeffery Tate	
Coalition for a Safe Environment	Jesse Marquez ¹ , Rick Pulido ²	Jesse Marquez
Communities for a Better Environment	Alicia Rivera ¹ , Ashley Hernandez ²	Alicia Rivera
Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma	Sylvia Betancourt ¹ , Maria Reyes ²	
Los Cerritos Neighborhood Association	Gary Hamrick ¹ , Joe Hower ²	Joe Hower
Philippine Action Group for the Environment	Fe P. Koons	
SBCC Thrive LA	Maribel Alejandre ¹ , Leticia Herrera ²	Maribel Alejandre
Category: Active Resident (city indicated below)		
Carson	Daniel Toledo	Daniel Toledo
Carson	Sergio Franco	
Carson	Joseph Luis Piñon ¹ , Yasaman Houshang ²	Joseph Luis Piñon
Carson	William Koons	William Koons
West Long Beach	Christopher Chavez ¹ , Pastor Anthony Quezada ²	Christopher Chavez
West Long Beach	Jacob Broderick ¹ , Emelio Ramirez ²	
West Long Beach	Ron Batiste	
West Long Beach	Whitney Amaya	
Wilmington	Salvador Lara ¹ , Victor Ibarra ²	Salvador Lara
Wilmington	Flavio Mercado	Flavio Mercado
Wilmington	Dulce Altamirano	Dulce Altamirano
Wilmington	Magali Sanchez-Hall ¹ , Sylvia Arredondo ²	
Category: Agency or School		
City of Carson	Saied Naaseh ¹ , McKina Alexander ²	McKina Alexander
City of Los Angeles	Uduak-Joe Ntuk ¹ , Erica Blyther ²	
Gulf Avenue Elementary School	Linda Bassett ¹ , Esperanza Romero ²	Linda Bassett
LA County Public Health	Matt Baca, Janet Scully	Matt Baca
Long Beach Public Health	Nelson Kerr ¹ , Judeth Luong ²	Nelson Kerr
Long Beach Unified School District	Brooke Murray	
Port of Los Angeles	Tim DeMoss ¹ , Amber Coluso ²	Tim Demoss
University of Southern California	Jill Johnston	
Category: Business, Business Organization, or Labor Organization		
Carson Chamber of Commerce	John Wogan ¹ , Ken Dami ²	John Wogan
Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce	Jeremy Harris ¹ , Brissa Sotelo ²	Brissa Sotelo
Wilmington Chamber of Commerce	Dan Hoffman ¹ , Cecilia Moreno ²	Dan Hoffman
Marathon Petroleum Company	Olga Chavez ¹ , Susan Stark ²	Susan Stark
Rail - Union Pacific	Lupe Valdez	
Trucking - Yusen Logistics	Cameron D. Smith ¹ , Nikki Nguyen ²	
Labor - USW Local 675	Pat Patterson	

Meeting Summary: During CSC Meeting #8, California Air Resources Board (CARB) presented their enforcement actions to address the air quality concerns in the Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach community. Susan Stark, Regulatory Affairs Manager, Marathon Petroleum Company, presented on their efforts in the community to address air quality concerns. Jo Kay Ghosh, Director of Community Air Programs at South Coast AQMD, provided an update on the revisions being made to the Draft CERP revisions, based on prior committee feedback and comments received. Payam Pakbin (Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) provided an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed in the community.

- **Welcoming Remarks, Community Testimonials, and Meeting #7 Recap & Current Progress: What We've Done So Far-**Valerie Martinez (Facilitator)
 - Valerie Martinez (Facilitator) welcomed guests, reviewed housekeeping rules.
 - Ryan Stromar (South Coast AQMD, Community Liaison) provided an update on the status of the community tour, which will be on Friday, August 9th. He mentioned that there has been a lot of participation so far, and encouraged anyone with questions to speak with him.
 - Valerie (Facilitator) reviewed the meeting objectives, which were to discuss comments received on the CERP, CARB's enforcement actions update, and community air monitoring efforts. She went over the progress over the past several months, and discussed the purpose and goals of AB 617. She commented that we have come a long way and wanted everyone to continue their discussions to move the document forward.

- **California Air Resources Board (CARB) Enforcement Actions:**
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) presented information on CARB's enforcement actions. She shared information about the CARB enforcement programs. She said that they have had many inspections for heavy-duty vehicles and at the ports, and their main goal is to bring people into compliance. She shared maps of their enforcement activities and went over the different levels of compliance in the community. She explained how idling trucks are a real concern and the enforcement difficulties encountered, and encouraged assistance from the committee to provide locations of idling vehicles. She said they also conduct fleet audits, updating engine requirements for their truck enforcement program and outlined the supplemental environmental projects (SEP) program.
 - Q and A on CARB Presentation:
 - Christopher Chavez (West Long Beach resident) inquired how often the emission standards are tightened for heavy-duty trucks, and if the 2010 rules are the cleanest they can be in terms of truck emissions.
 - Heather Arias (CARB) said that they have regulations on engine manufacturers. She said they do have engine standards on the books and are determining if they need to tighten them up. She said a truck must have a 2010 engine or newer to be compliant with their fleet rule.
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) asked if a plan is being proposed to reduce truck idling, the number of CARB inspectors and if this is in the budget for future years. He added that inspect container storage yards should also be inspected, because trucks idle there often.
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) said they want to think creatively and wanted to know if the signs that say "no idling" would be helpful.
 - Jesse Marquez said it would be helpful, but he said the Clean Up Green Up campaign in Los Angeles has proposed things that could be done, such as certain requirements for businesses

- that apply for a new license or permit. He also said they should hold several workshops for small business to teach them about different requirements and regulations. He expressed that these ideas to be incorporated in the AB 617 plan. He asked for an update on the international ship fuel standards regarding compliance rates from the Ports.
- Tim DeMoss (Port of Los Angeles) said that ships are required to use low sulfur fuels (.05 grams). He said that many of the ships coming into the Port are complaint with that, and are switching to even cleaner fuels.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) asked what opportunities are given to truck drivers to comply with the 2010 engine year requirement in the regulation. She said it is unfair for truck drivers, because they spend a lot of money on trucks and are out of work.
 - A CARB representative replied that they have incentive programs and their number one goal is to get cleaner trucks on the road. She said that there is funding that their Board set aside for loans. She said that CARB works with fleets to get their trucks into compliance.
 - Magali Sanchez-Hall (Wilmington resident) mentioned a land study she did with Jesse Marquez. She indicated that the idling happens in closed yards and there is not much that they can do, and suggested placing signs in the identified areas.
 - Brissa Sotelo (Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce) said that goals need to be set in place and based on what CSC members have said.
 - Maribel Alejandre (SBCC Thrive LA) asked about the clean idle stickers, CARB's collected data on the program, and if the trucks are actually clean and not emitting emissions.
 - A CARB representative replied that idling is a big concern, and that they are looking at what data they have on the trucks. She said CARB wants to work with everyone to see where truck idling is occurring, so that they can determine how bad it is. She did not know the exact number of clean idle trucks, and indicated that the information in their database.
 - McKina Alexander (City of Carson) inquired about the size of CARB's enforcement staff, and how many are assigned to their communities. She also inquired about the turnaround time for idling truck inspections and providing a status update to the concerned parties.
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) said they do not have many code inspectors, and indicated it is important for them to get information about the time and location. She said if they provide her their contact information that can help them receive a status update.
 - Flavio Mercado (Wilmington resident) commented that the Port of Los Angeles is very cooperative. He said that the refineries are the heavy polluters and the attention should not be diverted away from them. He also indicated that CARB needs to enforce engines that are newer than 2010.
 - A CARB representative clarified that their refinery inspections are specifically to evaluate whether the refineries are meeting fuel standards.
 - Salvador Lara (Wilmington resident) said that there is an issue with trucks in the community. He said there are trucks are idling on Lomita Avenue that need enforcement actions right now.
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) asked him to specify the specific area.
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) said that CARB is looking at doing more truck idling sweeps. She talked about outreach ideas and is open to ideas related to enforcement. She said she wants to make their efforts better for the entire community and is available if anyone wants to contact her.

- Magali Sanchez-Hall (Wilmington resident) inquired how to get the “no idling” signs.
 - Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) indicated that she can contact be contacted.
- Jesse Marquez commented there should be an app so that if someone sees idling, they can write down the license plate number or take a photo.
- **Committee Presenter-** Susan Stark (Regulatory Affairs Manager, Marathon Petroleum Company)
 - Susan Stark provided an overview of the Marathon facility and the staff who work there, and provided information about some of the things that Marathon has done to reduce emissions. She provided data on emission reductions of NOx and SOx, and mentioned their efforts to use cleaner fuels, implement their flare minimization plan, install benzene fence line monitoring (to comply with the US EPA requirement), and reduce fugitive emissions through the LDAR program. The LDAR program involves certified technicians conducting monthly monitoring of many components such as valves and pumps, and prompt repair of leaks. She talked about requirements for storage tanks and said that they are inspected every few months. She discussed the Los Angeles Refinery Integration and Compliance (LARIC) Project and the efforts to implement Rule 1180 refinery fence line monitoring. She mentioned a couple other projects under evaluation and said they are looking at reducing emissions from marine vessels through the LARIC crude tank project. She also mentioned that they have a summer youth internship program, and introduced the students in that program.
 - Q and A on Committee Presentation:
 - Erica Blyther (City of Los Angeles) wanted to know about a specific number on one of the slides, regarding the benzene concentration at the refinery fence line. She wanted to know the actual level.
 - A representative from Marathon said that the average is less than 1 ppb.
 - Dan Hoffman (Wilmington Chamber of Commerce) noted that there is a significant amount of pollution coming from mobile sources. He asked if diesel particulate matter is the biggest pollutant.
 - Jo Kay Ghosh (South Coast AQMD) replied that the emissions data that was previously provided is based on 2012 data, and that staff expects to complete the source attribution analysis before the next TAG meeting. She said diesel particulate matter is the main air toxic cancer risk driver in this community, as well as many other communities.
 - William Koons (Carson resident) asked how many tanks have vapor recovery systems. He also asked about candle and cylinder flares. He said how many candle flares are there and if there are plans to replace them.
 - A representative from Marathon said they follow regulations, but did not have the information about the exact number of tanks. He said they do not want to just replace flares, but rather find ways to not flare at all.
 - Daniel Toledo (Carson resident) wanted to know if the Watson Cogeneration plant has prevented flaring during power disruptions.
 - A representative from Marathon said that the Watson Cogeneration plant had a failing flare, but it has been fixed. He said there are occasional glitches, but they have a program to replace aged equipment.
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) said thank you to Marathon for having the cogen equipment. He asked if cogen plants cause air pollution.

- The Marathon representative said that having the cogen is the reason for reduced flaring at the Carson refinery, but it does have some emissions. He said it is as clean as they can make it.
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) asked if they are in compliance with the rule to replace tanks with domes.
 - The Marathon representative said they are.
 - Magali Sanchez-Hall (Wilmington resident) asked where the data came from in the report regarding flaring emissions.
 - The Marathon representative said that the flaring emissions slide was from the data provided by South Coast AQMD staff last month and the data on the other slide was from the previous South Coast AQMD meeting.
 - Flavio Mercado (Wilmington resident) said thank you to Marathon and their volunteers. He appreciates the efforts from Marathon, but he said when they do monitoring they need to keep the wind direction in mind.
 - Christopher Chavez (West Long Beach resident) said one of the goals for AB 617 was transitioning the RECLAIM program to BARCT. He wanted to know what Marathon is doing to anticipate this transition.
 - Susan Stark said they are complying with what is going on, but that RECLAIM will be around longer than anticipated. She said they are very involved with the regulatory development progress, and they are looking at technologies and anticipating the transition.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) asked if they got credit from South Coast AQMD for shutting down the Fluid Catalytic Cracking Unit (FCCU) for the LARIC project.
 - The Marathon representative said no, they surrendered the credits.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) asked about the LARIC project and the new storage tanks. She asked if they are switching to more extreme crude oil.
 - The Marathon representative said no, there is no change.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) asked if they have any wet scrubbers or if they will be installed.
 - The Marathon representative said no, they do not.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) asked if there is a technology for heaters, or cracking units that is used most often.
 - Marathon said they do have good technology for crackers, it is very big and reduces the PM emissions as good as any piece of equipment. He said they use the best technology available.
- **Discussion Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Update - Comments Received -Jo Kay Ghosh (Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)**
 - Jo Kay reviewed some of the main comments that were received on the Discussion Draft CERP, and how staff are addressing those comments. She mentioned that the Stationary Source Committee meeting will be held on July 26th and that staff aim to release the next draft (Draft CERP) before that meeting. Everyone will have until August 2nd, 2019 to submit comments on the Draft CERP. She discussed comments related to incentive funding, emission reduction targets, health data, zero-emission technology, enforcement activities, and provisions to further reduce emissions from refineries. She also shared and addressed comments about the Clean Air Action Plan (CAAP) and improving grant programs for trucks.

- Q and A on CERP Comments Received:
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) inquired about a public health baseline. He requested a public health baseline and expects South Coast AQMD to facilitate an establishment of the health data that is needed. He asked for a public health survey and recommended a CASPER study. He indicated that South Coast AQMD should track public health and allocate 1 million dollars towards the public health baseline. He expressed that they do not want an MOU, but an ISR.
 - Brissa Sotelo (Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce) said that the source attribution has not been provided and the CERP does not adequately outline the current or proposed reductions at a comprehensive level.
 - Christopher Chavez (West Long Beach resident) expressed the need for tangible reductions and community members would like to know how much cleaner their air will be, and indicated the need for South Coast AQMD to figure this out through a scientific process. He also expressed a concern about off-ramps being included in the CAAP and would like for the MOU to be as strong as possible.
 - Sarah Rees (Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, South Coast AQMD) explained why the MOU is being pursued with the Ports. She also described that the South Coast AQMD Board decided that if they weren't making progress with an MOU, they could pursue an ISR.
 - Susan Stark (Marathon Petroleum Company) asked about flaring and linking the source attribution to all of the CERP measures. She said it would be of interest for everyone.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) said she wanted to make sure that the comments were submitted. She wants to ensure there is an increase in criteria and metrics to meet health standards. She expressed that anticipated projections for air pollution needs to be addressed and wished that this had been made available for review sooner. She also expressed that this plan needs to include an estimation of oil refinery emissions and inventory levels.
 - Jo Kay Ghosh (South Coast AQMD) said the source attribution analysis reflects the impact of existing rules that have been adopted (but not any additional rule development that is occurring). She said that South Coast AQMD has many rule development efforts happening right now, but until they are adopted they can't be reflected in the analysis. She also mentioned that data from 2012 was shown in a previous meeting, and the key messages are similar with the more recent data. She discussed that one of the limitations is that the emissions inventory may not reflect fugitive emissions. Many of the actions in the CERP address fugitive emissions which would not be reflected in the emissions inventory, but emission reductions would indeed be achieved through these actions. She noted that unfortunately there is little they can do about the deadlines, but they are working very hard to produce the documents. Regarding a health study, she noted that the funding allocated to the air districts to implement AB 617 could not be used toward funding a health study. She understands the desire to see and measure public health impacts, and one of the ways to do that is through a health risk analysis type of study to quantify emission reductions as well as look at monitoring levels compared to health-based benchmarks.
 - Matt Baca (Los Angeles County Public Health) suggested to compile the comments into one document, with a tracking mechanism that shows how comments are being addressed or

when they will be addressed in the CERP. He said he would have to check regarding potential funding toward a CASPER type of health study.

- Flavio Mercado (Wilmington resident) expressed appreciation for the good work, and indicated that there is a lot of information missing. He said it would be helpful if key points from the committee were also mentioned. As far as refineries, he commented something needs to be done about the smokestacks.
 - Maribel Alejandre (SBCC Thrive LA) expressed the need to focus on the facts to measure reductions and know exactly what sources are contributing to emissions. She wanted more clarification on the data that has been presented because it does not make sense.
 - Susan Stark (Marathon Petroleum Company) clarified that Marathon does report fugitive emissions in their annual emissions reports, as well as RECLAIM emissions, and that both audited by South Coast AQMD.
 - Brissa Sotelo (Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce) said realizes that everyone has worked very hard, but wanted to remind everyone that emission reductions must be linked to AB 617.
- **Community Air Monitoring Update:** Payam Pakbin (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)
 - Payam Pakbin went over updates on the community air monitoring program. He talked about fixed and mobile monitoring and where they have been established. He shared images of sites and said the purpose of these sites is to establish a baseline and better understand the exposure of emissions. He said there are multiple purposes for mobile monitoring in the community. Some of these purposes include surveys to identify hot spots and source identification. He showed examples of the mobile monitoring platforms, as well as some of the preliminary results. He also talked about a special project in the community, in the West Rancho Dominguez where an investigative monitoring is occurring to identify potential sources of air toxic metals emissions. He went over the community air monitoring website and shared the web link. He said they are still trying to improve the website and provide more information. He said they launched their data display tool that can show all of the monitoring done in fixed monitoring stations.
 - Q and A on CAMP:
 - Magali Sanchez-Hall (Wilmington resident) expressed appreciation for the website. She suggested including a quick response code for residents to report data. She also inquired if the app will send out text messages when there are high levels of VOC in the community.
 - Flavio Mercado (Wilmington resident) inquired about the number of mobile monitoring vehicles and if these vehicles would follow the same route, so they can monitor changes can be determined within three or five minute intervals and for the evaluation of existing hot spots.
 - Payam Pakbin replied that South Coast AQMD has two mobile platforms and is working with a contractor who provides services with another mobile platform. He said they are also working with Google on some of the monitoring projects. He appreciated the suggestion and that they will report on this.
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) asked why some South Coast AQMD monitoring stations are included in the chart and others are not. He said there are other programs that display this data.
 - Payam Pakbin indicated they are waiting to display this data because it is still being worked on. He said the data display tool is a temporary solution and they are working on a comprehensive one.

- William Koons (Carson resident) said he saw the South Coast AQMD truck driving in Wilmington yesterday. It was driving way too slow in the right turn lane and it could have caused an accident. He also suggested categories of alerts on the monitoring data display.
 - Payam Pakbin said they are looking into this.
 - Brissa Sotelo (Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce) asked how quickly a comprehensible report is created once data is collected.
 - Payam Pakbin said it varies. It could take anywhere from a few days to several months. He said special projects are investigative efforts and it depends how quickly they can find and identify the sources, but they are being as transparent as possible.
 - Susan Stark (Marathon Petroleum Company) said there should be more recent mobile monitoring reports included in the presentation and the CSC would like to know if any new information is found.
- **Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders:**
 - Valerie (facilitator) said the next CSC meeting #9 is August 7th at the Carson Community Center beginning at 10:00 am, and the main topic will be discussing the Draft CERP. She went over upcoming dates for the TAG committee meeting, Ports MOU meeting, and the Stationary Source Committee meeting. She also mentioned that July 19 is the target date for the next draft of the CERP and the comment period for this document ends on August 2nd.
 - Comments from the CSC:
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) commented that he wants a list of current technologies to reduce emissions.
 - Christopher Chavez (West Long Beach resident) said it would be nice to see how the agency plans to respond to other comments that have been submitted online. He also wants a conversation about community engagement and how it will continue after the CERP is finished.
 - **Public Comments:**
 - Harvey Eder (member of the public) commented that the solar new deal with over 50 exhibits and new technologies has been submitted to the Board. He said every 3 years the state is required to make a new air plan and he said we need to expand to more communities.
 - A member of the public said a lot of local contractors work with refineries for Marathon.
 - Magali Sanchez-Hall (Wilmington resident) commented that she wants to see more contractors under union because the comparison is only 10 percent of total employees, out of approximately 2,000 contractors. She said the number must be higher so we can have some sort of economic sustainability.
 - A member of the public said carpenters support the clean air and they work at Marathon. He said they live in South Bay and they work long hours and see progress that has been made.
 - Mark Sheldon, a member of the public said they want a forward timeline about ongoing AB617 activities going on in different areas. He said with the special project under CAMP, it is hard to put into context if there are no numbers right now. He wants to see a path forward in terms of quantifying this.
 - Jason Low (Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, South Coast AQMD) replied that they plan on having the details public on the website in about a week and have all values at all monitoring stations.

- Maribel Alejandre (SBCC Thrive LA) said her organization works with low income students and they have over 410 of them working in these refineries and they do have an impact. She said she is here to be a voice for the students, and she doesn't think it's a matter of not being enough employees.
- Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) noted that the purpose of the CSC members is to reduce emissions and the problem is that refineries are fighting reducing emissions.