



South Coast

Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178

(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

November 17, 2016

mbaeza@cityofmenifee.us

Manny Baeza, Project Planner

City of Menifee, Community Development Department

29714 Haun Road

Menifee, CA 90802

**Initial Project Consultation for the
Specific Plan No. 2016-246 "Mill Creek Promenade" Project**

The South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The SCAQMD staff's comments are recommendations regarding the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the proposed project that should be included in the Draft CEQA document. Please send the SCAQMD a copy of the Draft CEQA document upon its completion. Note that copies of the Draft CEQA document that are submitted to the State Clearinghouse are not forwarded to the SCAQMD. Please forward a copy of the Draft CEQA document directly to SCAQMD at the address in our letterhead. **In addition, please send with the Draft CEQA document all appendices or technical documents related to the air quality and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all air quality modeling and health risk assessment files. These include original emission calculation spreadsheets and modeling files (not Adobe PDF files). Without all files and supporting air quality documentation, the SCAQMD will be unable to complete its review of the air quality analysis in a timely manner. Any delays in providing all supporting air quality documentation will require additional time for review beyond the end of the comment period.**

Air Quality Analysis

The SCAQMD adopted its California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Air Quality Handbook in 1993 to assist other public agencies with the preparation of air quality analyses. The SCAQMD recommends that the Lead Agency use this Handbook as guidance when preparing its air quality analysis. Copies of the Handbook are available from the SCAQMD's Subscription Services Department by calling (909) 396-3720. More recent guidance developed since this Handbook was published is also available on SCAQMD's website here: [http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-\(1993\)](http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-(1993)). SCAQMD staff also recommends that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod land use emissions software. This software has recently been updated to incorporate up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and replaces the now outdated URBEMIS. This model is available free of charge at: www.caleemod.com.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the project and all air pollutant sources related to the project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, that is, sources that generate or attract vehicular trips should be included in the analysis.

The SCAQMD has also developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. The SCAQMD staff requests that the lead agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the results to the recommended regional significance thresholds found here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf>. In addition to analyzing regional air quality impacts, the SCAQMD staff recommends calculating localized air quality impacts and comparing the results to localized significance thresholds (LSTs). LSTs can be used in addition to the recommended regional significance thresholds as a second indication of air quality impacts when preparing a Draft CEQA document. Therefore, when preparing the air quality analysis for the proposed project, it is recommended that the lead agency perform a localized analysis by either using the LSTs developed by the SCAQMD or performing dispersion modeling as necessary. Guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds>.

In the event that the proposed project generates or attracts vehicular trips, especially heavy-duty diesel-fueled vehicles, it is recommended that the lead agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment. Guidance for performing a mobile source health risk assessment (“*Health Risk Assessment Guidance for Analyzing Cancer Risk from Mobile Source Diesel Idling Emissions for CEQA Air Quality Analysis*”) can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mobile-source-toxics-analysis>. An analysis of all toxic air contaminant impacts due to the use of equipment potentially generating such air pollutants should also be included.

In addition, guidance on siting incompatible land uses (such as placing homes near freeways) can be found in the California Air Resources Board’s *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Perspective*, which can be found at the following internet address: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf>. CARB’s Land Use Handbook is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process.

Finally, should the proposed project include equipment that generates or controls air contaminants, a permit may be required and the SCAQMD should be listed as a responsible agency and consulted. The assumptions in the submitted Draft CEQA document would also be the basis for permit conditions and limits. Permit questions can be directed to the SCAQMD Permit Services staff at (909) 396-3385, who can provide further assistance.

Project Specific Comments – Sensitive Receptors Near Freeways

While the health science behind recommendations against placing sensitive receptors close to high volume urban roads and freeways is clear, SCAQMD staff recognizes the many factors Lead Agencies must consider when siting uses such as new housing. The lead agency should consider the limitations of enhanced filtration (HVAC systems with enhanced Maximum Efficiency Reporting Value – MERV filters) for the project, especially from traffic on high volume urban roadways or a freeway. For example, these filters have no ability to filter out any toxic gasses from vehicle exhaust; have higher long-term costs related to the required regular maintenance of the filters; and it is assumed that the HVAC units and the filters operate 100 percent of the time while residents are indoors. It is critical that any proposed mitigation must be carefully evaluated prior to determining if the health risks would be brought below CEQA significance thresholds. The presumed effectiveness and feasibility of proposed mitigation should therefore be evaluated and the Draft EIR document should also quantitatively demonstrate with substantial evidence the effectiveness of any proposed mitigation on any potentially significant impact.

Mitigation Measures

In the event that the project generates significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized during project construction and operation to minimize or eliminate these impacts. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15126.4 (a)(1)(D), any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be discussed. Mitigation Measure resources are available on the SCAQMD CEQA Air Quality Handbook website: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook>

Data Sources

SCAQMD rules and relevant air quality reports and data are available by calling the SCAQMD’s Public Information Center at (909) 396-2039. Much of the information available through the Public Information Center is also available via the SCAQMD’s webpage (<http://www.aqmd.gov>).

The SCAQMD staff is available to work with the lead agency to ensure that project emissions are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please contact Gordon Mize, Air Quality Specialist by e-mail at gmize@aqmd.gov or by phone at (909) 396-3302.

Sincerely,

Jillian Wong

Jillian Wong, Ph.D.
Planning and Rules Manager
Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

JW:GM

RVC161115-01
Control Number